



Dayal Singh S/o Sh. Mehal Singh,
Khasra No. 350/2, Gali No. 03
Block – B, Upkar Colony,
Burari, Delhi – 110084

....Appellant

V/s

Public Information Officer,
O/o The Director,
Local Government, Punjab,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35 - A,
Plot No. 03, Chandigarh

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The Director,
Local Government, Punjab,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35 - A,
Plot No. 03, Chandigarh

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 1293 of 2021

Present : Sh. Dayal Singh, the appellant in person.
Sh. Rajeev Saggarr, Superintendent-cum-PIO O/o C. V. O.(Vigilance Cell), in person.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.
The RTI request is dated 04.12.2020. First appeal is dated 19.01.2021. Second appeal has been received in the Commission on 10.03.2021.

On the last date of hearing, held on 07.06.2021 ;

- i) Sh. Rajeev Saggarr, Superintendent-cum-PIO, stated that the appellant sought information regarding action taken report by Enquiry Officer on a complaint dated 01.11.2020 and the said enquiry is under investigation as statement of appellant (Sh. Dayal Singh) is pending in the enquiry.
- ii) An opportunity was given to the appellant to visit the office of the respondent on 15.06.2021 at 12:00 P. M. so that required procedure could be followed to complete the enquiry.
- iii) An opportunity was given to the respondent to do the needful on 15.06.2021 at 12:00 P. M. during the visit of the appellant and send a reply, in writing, regarding the final outcome of the enquiry to the appellant with a copy to the Commission.
- iv) An opportunity was given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the information/reply, or not.

Sh. Rajeev Saggarr, Superintendent-cum-PIO office of C. V. O.(Vigilance Cell), who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that the appellant visited the office and inspected the relevant official record and identified the required information to be supplied. He also states that a reply has been sent to him vide letter no. 3116 dated 20.08.2021 and a copy of the same has also been sent to the Commission, which has been received in the Commission through an e-mail. It, alongwith a copy of annexure, is taken on record.

The appellant, Sh. Dayal Singh, who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that he has received the reply, but through that reply, action on the erring officials has not been given as demanded through RTI request.

Another opportunity is given to the respondent PIO to send a reply to the appellant, specifically mentioning that whether by 04.12.2020 any action was taken against the erring officials or not and send a copy of the same to the Commission.

An opportunity is given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the information/reply.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'



Dayal Singh S/o Sh. Mehal Singh,
Khasra No. 350/2, Gali No. 03
Block – B, Upkar Colony,
Burari, Delhi – 110084

....Appellant

V/s

Public Information Officer,
O/o The Director,
Local Government, Punjab,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35 - A,
Plot No. 03, Chandigarh

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The Director,
Local Government, Punjab,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35 - A,
Plot No. 03, Chandigarh

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 1296 of 2021

Present : Sh. Dayal Singh, the appellant in person.
Sh. Rajeev Saggarr, Superintendent-cum-PIO O/o C. V. O.(Vigilance Cell), in person.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.
The RTI request is dated 04.12.2020. First appeal is dated 19.01.2021. Second appeal has been received in the Commission on 10.03.2021.

On the last date of hearing, held on 07.06.2021 ;

- i) Sh. Rajeev Saggarr, Superintendent-cum-PIO, stated that the appellant sought information regarding action taken report by Enquiry Officer on a complaint dated 01.11.2020 and the said enquiry is under investigation as statement of appellant (Sh. Dayal Singh) is pending in the enquiry.
- ii) An opportunity was given to the appellant to visit the office of the respondent on 15.06.2021 at 12:00 P. M. so that required procedure could be followed to complete the enquiry.
- iii) An opportunity was given to the respondent to do the needful on 15.06.2021 at 12:00 P. M. during the visit of the appellant and send a reply, in writing, regarding the final outcome of the enquiry to the appellant with a copy to the Commission.
- iv) An opportunity was given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the information/reply, or not.

Sh. Rajeev Saggarr, Superintendent-cum-PIO office of C. V. O.(Vigilance Cell), who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that the appellant visited the office and inspected the relevant official record and identified the required information to be supplied. He also states that a reply has been sent to him vide letter no. 3116 dated 20.08.2021 and a copy of the same has also been sent to the Commission, which has been received in the Commission through an e-mail. It, alongwith a copy of annexure, is taken on record.

The appellant, Sh. Dayal Singh, who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that he has received the reply, but through that reply, action on the erring officials has not been given as demanded through RTI request.

Another opportunity is given to the respondent PIO to send a reply to the appellant, specifically mentioning that whether by 04.12.2020 any action was taken against the erring officials or not and send a copy of the same to the Commission.

An opportunity is given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the information/reply.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'

Anil Kumar
S/o Sh. Walaiti Ram,
'Gulati General Storte',
Dhobian Wali Gali, Subash Bazar,
KHANNA, Distt. – Ludhiana (Punjab)

...Appellant

V/s

Public Information Officer, (By Name)
O/o The Executive Officer ,
Nagar Council,
Khanna, Distt. - Ludhiana (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The Regional Deputy Director,
Urban Local Govt., Pb.,
Ludhiana (Punjab)

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 139 of 2020

Present : Sh. Narender Kumar on behalf of the appellant.
Sh. Rajesh Raini, Junior Engineer, on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

The RTI request is dated 19.08.2019. First appeal is dated 17.10.2019. Second appeal has been received in the Commission on 30.12.2019.

On the last date of hearing, held on 07.06.2021 ;

- i) The respondent PIO concerned was directed to supply the certified copies of the required information to the appellant through registered post with a copy to the Commission to the Commission.
- ii) An opportunity was also given to the appellant to confirm whether he received the information and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned

Sh. Narender Kumar, who appeared on behalf of the appellant, Sh. Anil Kumar in today's hearing, states that irrelevant information has been given to him by the respondent PIO.

Sh. Rajesh Raini, Junior Engineer, who appeared on behalf of the respondent PIO in today's hearing, states that through RTI request, the appellant has demanded information of all buildings situated in Khanna District, which is 'voluminous' information in nature,

Nevertheless, an opportunity is given to the appellant to visit the office of the respondent PIO and mention 05 to 07 buildings (regarding which information sought) and inspect the relevant official record on 31.08.2021 at 11:00 A. M. .

The respondent PIO concerned is directed to facilitate the appellant to inspect the relevant official record on 31.08.2021 at 11:00 A. M. so that the appellant could identify the required information.

Contd...2/-

The respondent-PIO concerned is directed to supply the required information, which would be identified by the appellant after inspection, to him as per official record with a copy to the Commission by the next date of hearing.

An opportunity is also given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the information, which would be supplied to him by the respondent PIO after inspection, or not and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned by the next date of hearing.

The date and time of inspection of relevant official record has been announced to both the parties during the proceedings of the instant appeal-case.

Both the parties mutually agreed to it during the hearing today.

The concerned PIO and Sh. Rajesh Raini, Junior Engineer, would remain present during the inspection of the relevant official record.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'

H. S. Hundal, Advocate,
Chamber No. 203, Judicial Courts,
Sector 76, S.A.S. Nagar (Mohali) - 160071 (Punjab)

...Appellant

V/s

Public Information Officer,
O/o The Secretary,
Regional Transport Authority,
Patiala (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The State Transport Commissioner,
Sector 17, Chandigarh

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 409 of 2020

Present : Sh. H. S. Hundal, Advocate, the appellant in person.
Sh. Shyam Lal Sharma, Asstt. Transport Officer, on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

The RTI request is dated 31.10.2019. First appeal is dated 01.12.2019. Second appeal has been received in the Commission on 21.01.2020.

On the last date of hearing, held on 07.06.2021,

- i) The appellant stated that he had not received the required information in the instant appeal-case.
- ii) Sh. Shyam Lal Sharma, Asstt. Transport Officer, stated that the required information was sent to the appellant vide letter dated 04.06.2021 through registered post.
- iii) An opportunity was given to the appellant to confirm whether he received the information and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned.

Sh. Shyam Lal Sharma, Asstt. Transport Officer, who appeared on behalf of the respondent PIO in today's hearing, states that a reply has been sent to the appellant vide letter 899 dated 04.06.2021 and again vide letter no. 347 dated 18.08.2021. He also intimates the Commission that a reply has also been sent to the Commission vide letter no. 348 dated 18.08.2021, which has been received in the Commission through an e-mail. It is taken on record.

The appellant, Sh. H. S. Hundal, Advocate, who appeared in person in today's hearing, intimates the Commission that through RTI request dated 31.10.2019, he has demanded information/documents/correspondence regarding Cancellation of Registration Certificate of Vehicle no. PB 11 AT 0082 and through a reply vide letter no. 372 dated 10.07.2020, the respondent has mentioned Vehicle no. PB 11 AT 8200. He further intimates that in another reply given vide letter no. 6264 dated 15.12.2020, the respondent has mentioned Vehicle no. PB 11 AT 0028, whereas the Vehicle no. PB 11 AT 0082.

Contd...2/-

Nevertheless, the respondent PIO concerned is directed to send a point-wise reply to the queries raised through RTI request dated 31.10.2019 again to the appellant, providing action taken by Secretary, Regional Transport Authority, Patiala on the complaint of the appellant with necessary supporting documents i. e. noting, directions passed, correspondence with any other offices or authorities, communication with applicant, status of the case till 31.10.2019 as demanded through RTI request, after doing the necessary corrections (as intimated above by the appellant) mentioning the correct vehicle number, with a copy to the Commission by the next date of hearing.

An opportunity is also given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the information/reply or not.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'

Rakesh Kumar Gupta
R/o # 8/237, Jagraon Road,
Mandi Mullanpur,
Distt.Ludhiana-141101(Punjab)

...Appellant

(Regd. Post) V/s
Public Information Officer,
O/o The Executive Officer,
Nagar Council, Jagraon,
District - Ludhiana (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The Regional Deputy Director,
Urban Local Bodies, Pb.,
Ludhiana (Punjab)

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 2608 of 2019

Present : Sh. Rakesh Kumar Gupta, the appellant in person.
Sh. Anil Kumar, Inspector, on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.
The RTI request is dated 04.07.2019. First appeal is dated 11.07.2019. Second
appeal has been received in the Commission on 23.07.2019.

On the last date of hearing, held on 07.06.2021 ;

- i) Final opportunity was given to the respondent PIO concerned to send compliance report of the orders dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 by supplying remaining information to the appellant.
- ii) An opportunity was given to the appellant to confirm whether he received the information and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned.

The appellant, Sh. Rakesh Kumar Gupta, who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that he visited the office of the respondent but he was not attended properly by any of official of respondent.

Sh. Anil Kumar, Inspector, who appeared on behalf of the respondent PIO in today's hearing, is not fully aware with the facts of the instant appeal-case.

Moreover, neither the respondent PIO concerned had sent any document, showing that the required information is supplied to the appellant nor he had intimated the Commission that whether orders dated 16.12.2020 passed by the Commission, through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed upon PIO of office of Executive Officer, Nagar Council, Jagraon, is complied with.

Nevertheless, Last and opportunity is given to the respondent PIO concerned to send compliance report of the orders dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 by supplying remaining information to the appellant, by the next date of hearing and also directed to remain present to represent this case in person on the next date of hearing fixed through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings' to clear the facts of this case. A copy of this order be also sent to him alongwith RTI request through registered post.

An opportunity is given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the remaining information, which would be sent to him by the respondent PIO and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned.

A copy of this order alongwith orders dated 16.12.2020 and 10.03.2021 be sent to Secretary of Department of Local Government, Punjab and Director, Local Government, Punjab through registered post with the directions to ensure compliance of the above-announced order and order dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 (through which directions were given to supply the remaining information to the appellant), by the next date of hearing positively.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

(Regd. Post)

- i) Public Information Officer,
O/o The Secretary to Government. of Punjab,
Deptt. of Local Government,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35 - A,
Plot No. 03, Chandigarh
Chandigarh

Encl: Order dated 16.12.2020
& 10.03.2021

(Regd. Post)

- ii) The Director,
Local Government, Punjab,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35,
Chandigarh

Encl: Order dated 16.12.2020
& 10.03.2021

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'

Rakesh Kumar Gupta
R/o # 8/237, Jagraon Road,
Mandi Mullanpur,
Distt.Ludhiana-141101(Punjab)

...Appellant

V/s
(Regd. Post) Public Information Officer,
O/o The Executive Officer,
Nagar Council, Jagraon,
District - Ludhiana (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The Regional Deputy Director,
Urban Local Bodies, Pb.,
Ludhiana (Punjab)

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 3450 of 2018

Present : Sh. Rakesh Kumar Gupta, the appellant in person.
Sh. Anil Kumar, Inspector, on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.
The RTI request is dated 04.07.2019. First appeal is dated 11.07.2019. Second
appeal has been received in the Commission on 23.07.2019.

On the last date of hearing, held on 07.06.2021 ;

- i) Final opportunity was given to the respondent PIO concerned to send compliance report of the orders dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 by supplying remaining information to the appellant.
- ii) An opportunity was given to the appellant to confirm whether he received the information and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned.

The appellant, Sh. Rakesh Kumar Gupta, who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that he visited the office of the respondent but he was not attended properly by any of official of respondent.

Sh. Anil Kumar, Inspector, who appeared on behalf of the respondent PIO in today's hearing, is not fully aware of the facts of the instant appeal-case.

Moreover, neither the respondent PIO concerned had sent any document, showing that the required information is supplied to the appellant nor he had intimated the Commission that whether orders dated 16.12.2020 passed by the Commission, through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed upon PIO of office of Executive Officer, Nagar Council, Jagraon, is complied with.

Nevertheless, Last and opportunity is given to the respondent PIO concerned to send compliance report of the orders dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 by supplying remaining information to the appellant, by the next date of hearing and also directed to remain present to represent this case in person on the next date of hearing fixed through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings' to clear the facts of this case. A copy of this order be also sent to him alongwith RTI request through registered post.

An opportunity is given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the remaining information, which would be sent to him by the respondent PIO and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned.

A copy of this order alongwith orders dated 16.12.2020 and 10.03.2021 be sent to Secretary of Department of Local Government, Punjab and Director, Local Government, Punjab through registered post with the directions to ensure compliance of the above-announced order and order dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 (through which directions were given to supply the remaining information to the appellant), by the next date of hearing positively.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

(Regd. Post)

- i) Public Information Officer,
O/o The Secretary to Government. of Punjab,
Deptt. of Local Government,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35 - A,
Plot No. 03, Chandigarh
Chandigarh

Encl: Order dated 16.12.2020
& 10.03.2021

(Regd. Post)

- ii) The Director,
Local Government, Punjab,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35,
Chandigarh

Encl: Order dated 16.12.2020
& 10.03.2021

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'

Rakesh Kumar Gupta
R/o # 8/237, Jagraon Road,
Mandi Mullanpur,
Distt.Ludhiana-141101(Punjab)

...Appellant

V/s
(Regd. Post) Public Information Officer,
O/o The Executive Officer,
Nagar Council, Jagraon,
District - Ludhiana (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The Regional Deputy Director,
Urban Local Bodies, Pb.,
Ludhiana (Punjab)

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 3451 of 2018

Present : Sh. Rakesh Kumar Gupta, the appellant in person.
Sh. Anil Kumar, Inspector, on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.
The RTI request is dated 04.07.2019. First appeal is dated 11.07.2019. Second

appeal has been received in the Commission on 23.07.2019.

On the last date of hearing, held on 07.06.2021 ;

- i) Final opportunity was given to the respondent PIO concerned to send compliance report of the orders dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 by supplying remaining information to the appellant.
- ii) An opportunity was given to the appellant to confirm whether he received the information and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned.

The appellant, Sh. Rakesh Kumar Gupta, who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that he visited the office of the respondent but he was not attended properly by any of official of respondent.

Sh. Anil Kumar, Inspector, who appeared on behalf of the respondent PIO in today's hearing, is not fully aware of the facts of the instant appeal-case.

Moreover, neither the respondent PIO concerned had sent any document, showing that the required information is supplied to the appellant nor he had intimated the Commission that whether orders dated 16.12.2020 passed by the Commission, through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed upon PIO of office of Executive Officer, Nagar Council, Jagraon, is complied with.

Nevertheless, Last and opportunity is given to the respondent PIO concerned to send compliance report of the orders dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 by supplying remaining information to the appellant, by the next date of hearing and also directed to remain present to represent this case in person on the next date of hearing fixed through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings' to clear the facts of this case. A copy of this order be also sent to him alongwith RTI request through registered post.

An opportunity is given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the remaining information, which would be sent to him by the respondent PIO and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned.

A copy of this order alongwith orders dated 16.12.2020 and 10.03.2021 be sent to Secretary of Department of Local Government, Punjab and Director, Local Government, Punjab through registered post with the directions to ensure compliance of the above-announced order and order dated 16.12.2020 (through which a penalty of Rs. 5000/- was imposed) and order dated 10.03.2021 (through which directions were given to supply the remaining information to the appellant), by the next date of hearing positively.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

(Regd. Post)

- i) Public Information Officer,
O/o The Secretary to Government. of Punjab,
Deptt. of Local Government,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35 - A,
Plot No. 03, Chandigarh
Chandigarh

Encl: Order dated 16.12.2020
& 10.03.2021

(Regd. Post)

- ii) The Director,
Local Government, Punjab,
Municipal Bhawan, Sector 35,
Chandigarh

Encl: Order dated 16.12.2020
& 10.03.2021

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'

Harinder Singh
S/o Sh. Nachhattar Singh,
V.P.O.-RahuriWali,
The. & Distt. – SriMuktsar Sahib(Punjab)

....Appellant

V/s

Public Information Officer,
O/o The Divisional Forest Officer,
SriMuktsar Sahib (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The Conservator of Forests, Punjab,
Ferozepur circle,
Ferozepur (Punjab)

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 2770 of 2020

Present : Sh. Harinder Singh, the appellant in person.
Sh. Hardeep Singh, Forest Range Officer, on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.
The RTI request is dated 11.03.2020. First appeal is dated 30.06.2020. Second

appeal has been received in the Commission on 22.09.2020.

On the last date of hearing, held on 09.06.2021,

- i) The appellant stated that he had not received copies of Muster Rolls from the respondent PIO till date.
- ii) Sh. Hardeep Singh, Forest Range Officer, states that available and givable information was supplied to the appellant vide letter no. 7360 dated 10.03.2021 and again vide letter no. 259 dated 15.04.2021. He also stated that copies of Muster Rolls carries addresses of workers, hence, could not be supplied as 'third party' information.
- iii) An opportunity was given to the respondent-PIO concerned to send/file a reply, in writing, in the shape of an affidavit, to the particular query regarding Muster Rolls to the appellant with a copy to the Commission.

The appellant, Sh. Harinder Singh, who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that he has not received copies of Muster Rolls from the respondent PIO till date.

Sh. Hardeep Singh, Forest Range Officer, who appeared on behalf of the respondent PIO in today's hearing, state that available and givable information has already been supplied to the appellant vide letter no. 7360 dated 10.03.2021 and again vide letter no. 259 dated 15.04.2021. He also states that a reply in an affidavit dated 15.06.2021 has also been sent to the Commission vide letter no. 1937 dated 21.06.2021. It has been received in the Commission vide letter no. 13701 dated 23.06.2021. He further states that in compliance to the order dated 09.06.2021, another reply in an affidavit dated 19.08.2021 has also been sent to the Commission vide letter no. 3522 dated 19.08.2021 with a copy to the appellant, appended to which is a letter signed by Under Secretary to Government of Punjab, Department of Administrative Reforms vide letter dated 09.08.2021, which shows that through Para 59 of Decision dated 13.11.2019 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India has defined 'Personal Information' under RTI Act, 2005 in a Civil Appeal no. 10044 of 2010 titled Central Public Information Officer, Supreme Court of India Vs. Subash Chander Agarwal. It has been received in the Commission vide Diary no. 18779 dated 23.08.2021. Both above-said replies in affidavits, alongwith annexure, are taken on record.

As Para 59 of Decision dated 13.11.2019, the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, in Civil Appeal no. 10044 of 2010 titled Central Public Information Officer, Supreme Court of India Vs. Subash Chander Agarwal, has defined 'Personal Information' under RTI Act, 2005 and the relevant operative part of the Judgment is reproduced below ;

xxx

xxx

xxx

"Reading of the aforesaid judicial precedents, in our opinion, would indicate that personal records, including name, address, physical, mental and psychological status, marks obtained, grades and answer sheets, are all treated as Personal Information. Similarly, professional records, including qualification, performance, evaluation reports, ACRs, disciplinary proceedings etc. are all Personal Information'. Medical records, treatment, choice of medicine, list of hospitals and doctors visited, findings recorded, including that of the family members, information relating to assets, liabilities, income tax returns, detail of investments, lending and borrowing, etc. are Personal Information'. Such Personal Information' is entitled to protection from unwarranted invasion of privacy and conditional access is available when stipulation invasion 'Larger Public Interest' is satisfied. This list is indicative and not exhaustive."

xxx

xxx

xxx

After hearing both the parties and examining the documents placed in the case-file, an opportunity is given to the appellant to visit the office of the respondent PIO to inspect the relevant official record (only regarding expenditure of Nurseries as demanded through RTI request) on 31.08.2021 at 11:00 A. M.

The respondent PIO concerned is directed to facilitate the appellant to inspect the relevant official record only regarding expenditure of Nurseries on 31.08.2021 at 11:00 A. M. so that the appellant could identify the required information.

The respondent-PIO concerned is directed to supply the required information, which would be identified by the appellant after inspection, to him with a copy to the Commission by the next date of hearing.

An opportunity is also given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the information, which would be supplied to him by the respondent PIO after inspection, or not.

The date and time of inspection of relevant official record has been announced to both the parties during the proceedings of the instant appeal-case.

Both the parties mutually agreed to it during the hearing today.

Sh. Hardeep Singh, Forest Range Officer, would remain present during the inspection of the relevant official record.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'



(Regd. Post) **Dara Singh**
S/o Sh. Baldev Singh,
H. No. 200, Street – 02,
Defence Colony, Malerkotla,
Distt. – Sangrur - 148023 (Punjab)Appellant

V/s

(Regd. Post) **Public Information Officer,**
O/o The Addl. Chief Judge,
Senior Division,
Malerkotla (Punjab)

First Appellate Authority,
O/o The Addl. Chief Judge,
Senior Division,
Malerkotla (Punjab)

...Respondents

Appeal Case No. 1571 of 2021

Present : **Sh. Dara Singh, the appellant in person.**
Ms. Anjali, Reader on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

The RTI request is dated 24.11.2020. First appeal is dated 24.12.2020. Second appeal has been received in the Commission on 09.04.2021.

On the last date of hearing, held on 07.07.2021 ;

- i) The respondent PIO was directed to file a written reply specifically mentioning the case number, which was disposed with a copy of order passed under signatures of the concerned PIO(himself) with the directions to mention that no case titled as 'Sukhvir Kaur Versus Racchpal Singh' of 12.06.2002 is found in the Peshi Register of date 30.10.2004 as per official record.
- ii) The parties (above-said) were directed to represent this case in person or through their representatives, on the next date of hearing with relevant documents so that the facts of this case could be cleared.

The appellant, Sh. Dara Singh, who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that he has not received any reply from the respondent PIO till date.

Ms. Anjali, Reader, who appeared on behalf of the respondent PIO in today's hearing, states that a reply vide letter no. 537 dated 23.07.2021 with a copy of order dated 28.11.2006 passed by Hon'ble Addl. Civil Judge (Sr. Divn.), Malerkotla in a Suit No. 19/15.01.2005 has been sent to the Commission, which has been received in the Commission vide Diary No. 16717 dated 29.07.2021. In that reply, it is mentioned that no case titled as 'Sukhvir Kaur Versus Racchpal Singh' of 12.06.2002 is found in the Peshi Register of dated 30.10.2004, moreover, there is no entry of any case on 30.10.2004. It, alongwith said annexure, is taken on record.

As reply vide letter no. 537 dated 23.07.2021 has been sent to the Commission not to the appellant, hence, the PIO concerned is directed to send the reply to the appellant through registered post and copy of postal receipt be sent to the Commission.

The respondent PIO concerned is also directed to facilitate the appellant to inspect the relevant official record i. e. 'Peshi Register' on 25.08.2021 at 03:00 P. M. so that the appellant could identify the required information.

The appellant is advised to avail the opportunity to inspect the relevant official record i. e. 'Peshi Register' on 25.08.2021 at 03:00 P. M. to identify the information.

The respondent-PIO concerned is directed to supply the required information, which would be identified by the appellant after inspection, to him as per official record with a copy to the Commission by the next date of hearing.

An opportunity is also given to the appellant to confirm whether he has received the information, which would be supplied to him by the respondent PIO after inspection, or not and also to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned by the next date of hearing.

Both the parties mutually agreed to it during the hearing today.

The date and time of inspection of relevant official record has been announced to both the parties during the proceedings of the instant appeal-case.

The case is adjourned to 22nd September, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties through registered post.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'

Makhan Singh S/o Sh. Pritam Singh,
H. No. 2635, Phase – 7,
S. A. S. Nagar (Mohali) (Punjab)

.... Complainant

V/s

Public Information Officer,
O/o The District Horticulture Officer,
S. A. S. Nagar (Mohali) (Punjab)

...Respondents

Complaint Case No. 284 of 2020

Present : Sh. Makhan Singh, the complainant in person.
Sh. Jaspreet Singh, Horticulture Development Officer, on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

Heard through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.
The RTI request is dated 17.03.2020. The complaint has been received in the
Commission on 15.05.2020.

On the last date of hearing, held on 19.07.2021 ;

- i) The complainant stated that incomplete information was supplied to him by the respondent PIO and whatever information was supplied to him is not certified. He also stated that he had pointed out certain deficiencies in the information supplied to him to the respondent PIO.
- ii) Another opportunity was given to the respondent PIO concerned to remove the deficiencies, which were pointed out by the complainant, to him by registered post with a copy to the Commission.
- iii) An opportunity was given to the complainant to confirm whether he has received the information or not.

Sh. Jaspreet Singh, Horticulture Development Officer, who appeared on behalf of the respondent PIO in today's hearing, states that certified copies of the requisite information of fourteen pages has been supplied to the complainant vide letter no. 699 dated 23.08.2021 in person at his residence, which is handed over to one of his (complainant's) family member. He also intimates the Commission that a reply has also been sent to the Commission vide letter no. 700 dated 23.08.2021, which has been received in the Commission vide Diary No. 18811 dated 23.08.2021. It, along with a copy of supplied information, is taken on record.

The complainant, Sh. Makhan Singh, who appeared in person in today's hearing, states that through telephonic communication at his residence, he came to know that information has been sent by the respondent at his residence today itself i. e. 23.08.2021 and his family member has received the same. He further requests that as he has not gone through the supplied information yet, hence, seeks an adjournment in this case so that he could go through the supplied information and deficiencies, if any, could be pointed out.

Nevertheless, an opportunity is given to the appellant to point out deficiencies, if any, in the information supplied to him, in writing, to the respondent PIO well in time so that the same could be removed by the respondent concerned by the next date of hearing.

The case is adjourned to 10th November, 2021 (Wednesday) at 11:00 A. M. for hearing through facility of Software/application 'CISCO Webex Meetings'.

Copies of the orders be sent to the parties.

Date : 23rd August, 2021

(Sanjiv Garg)
State Information Commissioner
Punjab

Note : Install → CISCO WEBEX Meetings → Click on Join Meeting → Enter Meeting Code ID No. i. e. is '1589136034'